

Slay Some Earthly Demons IX

Document: n3347

Author: Martin Uecker

Date: 2024-09-08

This remaining issues from n3244 were split up into the following series:

n3340 - Slay Some Earthly Demons II
n3341 - Slay Some Earthly Demons III
n3342 - Slay Some Earthly Demons IV
n3343 - Slay Some Earthly Demons V
n3344 - Slay Some Earthly Demons VI
n3345 - Slay Some Earthly Demons VII
n3346 - Slay Some Earthly Demons VIII
n3347 - Slay Some Earthly Demons IX

Meeting meeting notes about previous discussion can be found in n3281. The following numbers correspond to N3220 and the ones with (→) to N3301.

J.2.19 needs more work, cf. SC22WG14.25600 (**note to editor:** parts applied by mistake)
J.2.21 done (incl. additional change), (**note to editor:** there is a “not“ missing in 6.3.2.1)
n3340 J.2.40 (→ J.2.38) withdrawn in June, now revised (cf. SC22WG14.25600)
J.2.56 done
J.2.57 done (option 1)
n3341 J.2.58 (→ J.2.54) not discussed in June
J.2.60 (→ J.2.56) direction to editor (**note to editor:** not yet done)
n3342 J.2.63 (→ J.2.59) no consensus in June, now revised to make implementation-defined
n3343 J.2.64 (→ J.2.59) wording change not related to an entry in Annex J
J.2.67 done
J.2.69 done (alternative wording for semantic section)
n3344 J.2.75 (→ J.2.70) now revised (cf. SC22WG14.25600)
J.2.77 (→ J.3.13. 2) not discussed in June, but fixed editorially
J.2.78 (→ J.3.13. 3) not discussed in June, but fixed editorially
n3345 J.2.79 (→ J.2.72) not discussed in June
n3346 J.2.80-J.2.82 (→ J.2.73-J.2.75) not discussed in June (cf. SC22WG14.25600)
n3347 J.2.87 (→ J.2.80) not discussed in June

Acknowledgments: Thanks to Joseph Myers, David Svoboda, Chris Bazley, and the UB study group for helpful comments and corrections.

Annex J (J.2.80 in N3301, J.2.87 in N3220)

(80) An identifier for an object with internal linkage and an incomplete type is declared with a tentative definition (6.9.3).

Analysis (updated)

When the type is not completed this is rejected by GCC and Clang. When the type is completed later, it is accepted (by GCC with a warning).

Example (updated)

<https://godbolt.org/z/1Ejfajfff>

```
struct foo;
static struct foo x;
```

<https://godbolt.org/z/GKq7KoTh1>

```
struct foo;
static struct foo x;
struct foo { int y; };

int main(void)
{
    (void)x;
    return 0;
}
```

Proposed Change

Note to editor: Move the following to a new Constraints Section

13 If the declaration of an identifier for an object is a tentative definition and has internal linkage, the declared type shall not be **an** incomplete **type at the end of the translation unit.**