Doc No: N2840=09-0030
Date: 2009-03-05
Author: Pablo Halpern
Cilk Arts, Inc.

phalpern@halpernwightsoftware.com

Defects and Proposed Resolutions for Allocator Concepts (Rev 2)

Contents

| National Body Comments Addressed in this Paper | 1 |
|--|----|
| Summary | 2 |
| Changes from N2829 (Rev 1) | 2 |
| Changes from N2810 | 2 |
| Document Conventions | 2 |
| Typographical and Editorial Errors | 3 |
| Allocator concept does not match all C++03 allocators | 3 |
| Allocator::rebind is different from C++03 rebind | 4 |
| Construct Method is Limited to value_type | 4 |
| construct_element Function is Unnecessary | 5 |
| Allocator Propagation Relies on Traits Instead of Concepts | 6 |
| s_scoped_allocator Trait is not Used | |
| scoped_allocator_adaptor has errors | 7 |
| Two Types of scoped_allocator_adaptors | 7 |
| Proposed Wording | 8 |
| Typographical and Editorial Corrections | 8 |
| Revised Allocator Concept | 9 |
| Legacy Allocators | 10 |
| Rename rebind to rebind_type | 14 |
| Replace construct_element with construct | 15 |
| Allocator Propagation | 16 |
| Remove is_scoped_allocator trait | 19 |
| Modified scoped_allocator_adaptor | 19 |
| References | 26 |

National Body Comments Addressed in this Paper

The previous version of this paper (N2810) comprises the proposed resolution for CD comment numbered US 75. The issues with pair have been split off into a separate paper:

<u>N2834</u>. This proposal provides formal wording for the resolutions to UK 223 and UK 224 and addresses most of the concerns of US 65 and US 74.

Summary

The addition of concepts for allocators in the standard library is incomplete and has a number of defects. Each defect is listed below with a proposed resolution. For easier reference, there is no formal wording for individual proposed resolutions. Instead, formal wording for all of the proposed resolutions is merged into one set of changes at the end of the document.

Changes from N2829 (Rev 1)

- Updated references to refer to October 2009 CD instead of the WP.
- Clarified some text and fixed numerous typos and small omissions.
- Simplified AllocatableElement and removed the has custom construct trait.
- More thorough cleaning of remnants of the pre-concept allocator stuff in response to NB comments.

Changes from N2810

- Added more specific proposed wording.
- Moved discussion for reducing the number of pair constructors into a separate paper (N2834).
- Removed issue about vector and string being under-constrained. Vector and basic string will work fine with non-native pointer types.
- Replaced the AdvancedAllocator concept with a custom_construct associated type in the Allocator concept.
- This version of the proposal uses rebind_type instead of related_instance as the replacement for rebind in the Allocator concept.

Document Conventions

All section names and numbers are relative to the October 2008 CD, N2800.

Existing and proposed working paper text is indented and shown in dark blue. Small edits to the working paper are shown with red strikeouts for deleted text and green underlining for inserted text within the indented

blue original text. Large proposed insertions into the working paper are shown in the same dark blue indented format (no green underline).

Comments and rationale mixed in with the proposed wording appears as shaded text.

Requests for LWG opinions and guidance appear with light (yellow) shading. It is expected that changes resulting from such guidance will be minor and will not delay acceptance of this proposal in the same meeting at which it is presented.

Typographical and Editorial Errors

Description of Issue

The latest WP contains a number of errors of a typographical or editorial nature.

Proposed Resolution

Correct the errors as described in the proposed wording section of this paper.

Allocator concept does not match all C++03 allocators

Description of Issue

The reason that Allocator is declared auto is to support backwards compatibility with C++03 allocators. Otherwise, the Allocator concept is not the kind of concept that would normally be declared auto. However, declaring it auto does not fully succeed at providing this backwards compatibility. C++03 allocators do not have a generic_pointer type nor a variadic construct function. Moreover, the non-variadic construct function in the C++03 allocator takes a pointer argument instead of a T* argument as in the concept. As a result, there are some C++03 allocators for which there would be no automatically-generated concept map.

Proposed Resolution

Remove the auto modifier from the Allocator concept. This change will make Allocator cleaner (by avoiding gratuitous use of auto) and will allow additional evolution without the constraint of automatic compatibility with C++03 allocators. To address the compatibility problem, add a LegacyAllocator auto concept and concept_map for Allocator to automatically adapt any class meeting the requirements of a C++03.

N2840: Defects and Proposed Resolutions for Allocator Concepts (Rev 2)

Allocator::rebind is different from C++03 rebind

Description of Issue

The rebind template in the Allocator concept serves the same purpose as the rebind template in the C++03 allocator requirements, but uses a different syntax for both definition and declaration. In the case of a C++03 allocator, rebinding is done by referencing Alloc::rebind<U>::other, whereas in C++0x, rebinding is done by referencing: Allocator<Alloc>::rebind<U> (no other nested type). Moreover, the declaration of rebind in a C++0x concept map is simpler than in a C++03 allocator: template <class T> rebind = MyAlloc<T>; instead of template <class T> struct rebind { typedef MyAlloc<T> other; };. These differences are confusing and could cause strange compilation errors when adding constraints to an unconstrained container template.

Proposed Resolution

Rename the rebind template in the Allocator concept to something else. Some ideas are rebind_type, retype, related_type, sibling, or sibling_allocator. I used rebind_type in the proposed wording because it will be familiar to C++03 programmers, yet different enough for the compiler to tell you when you've used the wrong one. The definition of rebind_type in the concept map for legacy allocators can still be implemented in terms of rebind.

Construct Method is Limited to value_type

Description of Issue

The construct method in the Allocator concept only constructs objects of type value_type. This constraint can lead to inconvenient and sometimes inefficient uses of rebind_type in order to construct objects of different types. For example, a container type might allocate objects of type Node<T> from an allocator, alloc_, of type allocator_type == Alloc<Node<T>>. However, some parts of the Node might be initialized independently of the T object contained within it. Initializing an inner object of type U would require the use of rebind type as follows:

```
Allocator<allocator_type>::rebind_type<U>(alloc_).construct(p, args);
```

The above construct is not only hard to read, but it constructs a temporary object of type Alloc<T> just to call its construct method.

Proposed Resolution

(Note: This resolution is refined by the resolution of the next issue.) We have already changed construct to a template in order to support emplace. It is a small matter, then, to templatize the pointer argument as well as the constructor arguments:

```
template<typename T, typename... Args>
  requires HasConstructor<T, Args&&...>
    void X::construct(T* p, Args&&... args)
{
    ::new ((void*) p) T(forward<Args>(args)...);
}
```

construct_element Function is Unnecessary

Description of Issue

The construct_element function was originally introduced to centralize the moderately-complex, traits-based dispatch of the construction of elements based a number of allocator and element traits. The advent of concepts allows us to eliminate the construct_element meta-programming layer and express constraints directly in the declaration of the construct member for each allocator.

Proposed Resolution

Remove the global construct_element template and remove the construct_element function from the AllocatableElement concept. Move the construct function from the Allocator concept to the AllocatableElement concept, as shown in the proposed wording section of this paper. This change will also lift the restriction on construct described in the previous issue. Change other uses of construct_element to use construct directly. For consistency, move destroy from Allocator to AllocatableElement, as well.

This change, however, will remove the default implementation of construct because such a default implementation would potentially bypass constraints required by a specialized allocator (such as a scoped allocator). However, the typical implementation of construct can be inserted into an allocator with a simple cut-and-paste of a tiny amount of boilerplate code (with no changes to the boilerplate), so losing the default implementation will not make much difference to an allocator author.

Allocator Propagation Relies on Traits Instead of Concepts

Description of Issue

```
The allocator propagation traits, allocator_propagate_never, allocator_propagate_on_copy_construction, allocator_propagate_on_move_assignment, and allocator_propagate_on_copy_assignment are pre-concept ways to express what can now be expressed more cleanly with concepts. These traits control the behavior of allocator propagation for a set of static member functions in the allocator_propagation_map structure. The system is unnecessarily complex now that we have an Allocator concept into which we can directly insert the propagation functions with default implementations.
```

Proposed Resolution

Add the following five functions and default implementations to the Allocator concept. (The fifth function is for move-construction, which is not separately accounted-for in the current WP):

```
Alloc select_on_container_copy_construction(const Alloc& x) { return x; } Alloc select_on_container_move_construction(Alloc&& x) { return move(x);} void do_on_container_copy_assignment(Alloc& to, Alloc& from) { } void do_on_container_move_assign(Alloc& to, Alloc&& from) { } void do on container_swap(Alloc& a, Alloc& b) { }
```

Refinements of Allocator for individual allocator types can override these defaults as desired.

See the proposed wording section for an embodiment of this proposed resolution.

is_scoped_allocator Trait is not Used

Description of Issue

The is_scoped_allocator trait is still in the WP, but is not referenced since allocator concepts were introduced. A concept-based approach needs to be introduced to replace the purpose of the is_scoped_allocator trait – i.e., to dispatch the element-construction functionality based on allocator type.

Proposed Resolution

Remove the is_scoped_allocator trait. Constrain the construct member function of any scoped allocator such that an element must be ConstructibleWithAllocator using the inner allocator type. Combined with the proposed resolution for the previous issue

(moving the construct function into AllocatableElement), this resolution removes scoped allocator notions from unrelated parts of the standard, reducing clutter and confusion.

scoped allocator adaptor has errors

Description of Issue

The scoped_allocator_adaptor templates have errors in them, some of which cause them not to model the Allocator concept in every detail. Specifically:

- There are places where void is used instead of *unspecified allocator type*.
- The construct and destroy methods take pointer instead of value_type*. (But if the resolution to the construct issue is accepted, it should take a pointer to template-argument type.)
- Some Allocator constraints are missing.

Proposed Resolution

Correct the errors. See related issues in this paper for other changes that may apply.

Two Types of scoped allocator adaptors

Description of Issue

The WP describes <code>scoped_allocator_adaptor</code> as a class template with two template parameters, one for the outer allocator type and one for the inner allocator type. A specialization of <code>scoped_allocator_adaptor</code> takes only one template parameter. In the latter case, not only are both the outer and inner allocators the same type, they are also the same object. Thus there is a difference between <code>scoped_allocator_adaptor<Al</code>, <code>Al></code>, which holds two distinct instances of type <code>Al</code>, and <code>scoped_allocator_adaptor<Al></code>, which holds a single instance of type <code>Al</code>. This use of a default parameter has already caused significant confusion.

Proposed Resolution

Use separate names, <code>scoped_allocator_adaptor</code> and <code>scoped_allocator_adaptor2</code> for the single-parameter and dual-parameter adaptor templates, respectively. Remove the default argument of <code>unspecified</code> allocator type.

Proposed Wording

Typographical and Editorial Corrections

Section 20.7 [memory], Header <memory> synopsis, add missing close-angle-bracket and remove unnecessary semicolon:

(and a number of other occurrences).

Section 21.3, remove reference to obsolete traits:

Section 23.1, Table 82, remove rows dealing with traits that have been obsolete by concepts:

| uses_allocator <x, q=""></x,> | derived from true_type | true_type if Q is | compile time |
|---|--------------------------|-------------------|-------------------------|
| | or false_type | convertible to A | |
| <pre>constructible_with_allocator_suffix<x></x></pre> | derived from true_type | | Compile time |

Section 30.5.1 [futures.overview], synopsis, correct use of obsolete traits:

```
template <class R, class Alloc>
    struct uses_allocatorpromise<R>, Alloc>;
    concept map UsesAllocatorpromise<R>, Alloc> {
        typedef Alloc allocator type;
     }
    template <class R>
        struct constructible with allocator prefixpromise<R> >;
```

Remove section 30.5.7 [futures.allocators] entirely:

```
30.5.7 Allocator Templates [futures.allocators] template <class R, Etc...
```

Revised Allocator Concept

In section 20.7 [memory], remove the auto keyword from the Allocator concept, correct the spelling of HasDereference and rebind type:

In section 20.7.2.2 [allocator.concepts], modify the Allocator concept and add a concept map as follows:

```
auto concept Allocator<typename X> :
  CopyConstructible<X>, EqualityComparable<X> {
    ObjectType value type = typename X::value type;
    requires FreeStoreAllocatable<value type>;
    Dereferenceable HasDereference pointer = $00 below;
    Dereferenceable HasDereference const pointer = See below;
    requires Regular<pointer>
          && RandomAccessIterator<pointer>
          && Regular<const pointer>
          && RandomAccessIterator<const pointer>;
    SignedIntegralLike difference type =
        RandomAccessIterator<pointer>::difference type;
    typename generic pointer = void*;
    typename const generic pointer = const void*;
    typename reference = value_type&;
    typename const reference = const value type&;
    UnsignedIntegralLike size type = $60 below;
    template<ObjectType T> class rebind type = $800 bollow;
    requires Destructible < value type >;
    requires Convertible pointer, const pointer>
          && Convertible<pointer, generic pointer>
          && SameType<pointer::result type, value type&>
          && SameType<pointer::result type, reference>;
    requires Convertible < const_pointer, const_generic_pointer >
          && SameType<const pointer::result type, const value type&>
          && SameType<const pointer::result type, const reference>;
    requires SameType<rebind type<value type>, X>;
    requires SameType<generic pointer
                      , rebind type<unspecified unique type>::generic pointer>;
        // see description of generic pointer, below
    requires SameType<const generic pointer
                 , rebind type< unspecified unique type>::const generic pointer>;
        // see description of generic pointer, below
    pointer X::allocate(size type n);
```

```
pointer X::allocate(size type n, const generic pointer p);
void X::deallocate(pointer p, size type n);
size type X::max size() const {
     return numeric limits<size type>::max(); }
template<ObjectType T> X::X(const rebind type<T>& y);
template<typename... Args>
requires HasConstructor<value type, Args&&...>
void X::construct(value type* p, Args&&... args)
  ::new ((void*) p) value type(forward<Args>(args)...);
void X::destroy(value type* p) {
    addressof(*p)->~value type();
pointer X::address(reference r) const {
    return addressof(r); // see below
const pointer X::address(const reference r) const {
    return addressof(r); //see below
X select on container copy construction(const X& x) { return x; }
X select on container move construction(X&& x) { return move(x); }
void do on container copy assignment(X& to, const X& from) { }
void do on container move assignment(X& to, X&& from) { }
void do on container swap(X& a, X& b) { }
```

Remove the definition of construct at paragraph 15:

```
template<typename... Args>
-requires HasConstructor<value_type, Args&&...>
-void X::construct(value_type* p, Args&&... args);
```

Effects: Calls the constructor for the object at p, using the args constructor arguments.

Default: ::new ((void*) p) value type(forward<Args>(args)...);

Legacy Allocators

At the start of 20.7.2.2 [allocator.concepts], after the definition of the Allocator concept, add a new sub-section:

20.7.2.2.1 Support for legacy allocators [allocator.concepts.legacy]

Classes that meet the allocator requirements described in table 32 of ISO/IEC 14882:2003 are known as *legacy Allocators*. The LegacyAllocator auto concept abstracts the requirements of legacy allocators. A concept map adapts LegacyAllocator to the Allocator concept. [*Note:* not all legacy allocator requirements can be precisely described using concepts. In particular, rebind is under-constrained and the second argument of allocate(p,u) is discarded in the default implementation to make up for the fact that it is over-constrained. Legacy allocators that are not a precise fit for the LegacyAllocator concept can be used as allocators by supplying a concept map adapting them to the Allocator concept. — *end note*]

```
auto concept LegacyAllocator<typename X> :
  DefaultConstructible<X>, CopyConstructible<X>, EqualityComparable<X> {
    HasDereference pointer = X::pointer;
    HasDereference const pointer = X::const pointer;
    typename generic pointer = void*;
    typename const generic pointer = const void*;
    typename reference = X::reference;
    typename const reference = X::const reference;
    ObjectType value type = typename X::value type;
    UnsignedIntegralLike size type = X::size type;
    SignedIntegralLike difference type = X::difference type;
    template<ObjectType T> struct rebind = see below;
    requires Destructible < value type >;
    requires Regular<pointer>
          && RandomAccessIterator<pointer>
          && Regular<const pointer>
          && RandomAccessIterator<const pointer>;
    requires Convertible pointer, const pointer>
          && Convertible<pointer, generic pointer>
          && SameType<pointer::result type, value type&>
          && SameType<pointer::result_type, reference>;
    requires Convertible < const pointer, const generic pointer>
          && SameType<const pointer::result type, const value type&>
          && SameType<const_pointer::result_type, const reference>;
    requires IntegralType<size type> && IntegralType<difference type>;
    pointer X::address(reference r) const;
    const pointer X::address(const reference r) const;
    pointer X::allocate(size type n);
    pointer X::allocate(size type n, generic pointer p)
        { return X::allocate(n); }
    void X::deallocate(pointer p, size type n);
    size type X::max size() const;
    template<ObjectType T>
      requires See below
        X::X(const typename rebind<T>::other& y);
```

```
//Not used, but part of Table 32
requires CopyConstructible<value_type>
        void X::construct(pointer_type p, const value_type&);

void X::destroy(pointer p);
}
template <LegacyAllocator X>
    concept_map Allocator<X> {
    typedef X::value_type value_type;
    typedef X::pointer pointer;
    typedef X::const_pointer const_pointer;
    typedef X::generic_pointer generic_pointer;
    typedef X::const_generic_pointer const_generic_pointer;
    typedef X::difference_type difference_type;
    typedef X::size_type size_type;
    typedef X::reference reference;
    typedef X::const_reference const_reference;

template<ObjectType T> using rebind_type = $00 below;
}
```

The rebind requirements and the requirements on the rebind-conversion constructor can be implemented using a __HasOther and an __AllocRebindTypeOf concept:

```
auto concept __HasOther<typename T> {
    typename other = typename T::other;
}

concept __AllocRebindTypeOf<typename Y, typename X> { }

auto concept LegacyAllocator<typename X> : ... {
    ...
    template<ObjectType T> struct rebind;
    requires __Ho = __HasOther<rebind<value_type>>;
    requires SameType<__Ho::other, X>;
    requires __AllocRebindTypeOf<__Ho::other, X>;
    ...
    template<typename Y>
    requires __AllocRebindTypeOf<Y, X>
    X::X(const Y& y);
}

template <LegacyAllocator X, ObjectType T>
    requires __Ho = __HasOther<X::rebind<T>>
        concept_map __AllocRebindTypeOf<__Ho::other, X> {}
}
```

Note that the construct () function in the legacy allocator is ignored in the concept-map mapping. ISO/IEC 14882:2003 did not require that construct be called by containers and many implementations handled it inconsistently. The addition of the variadic construct function makes a direct mapping from C++03 allocators to C++0x allocators impossible. An

adaptor function could construct a temporary object of type value_type, then call the C++03 construct function, but that would add a new CopyConstructible requirement and a quiet inefficiency (caused by an extra copy) for all C++03 allocators even though very few require a custom construct function. It seems safer to simply ignore the legacy construct function and let the user create their own concept map if necessary.

There is no way to derive a generic_pointer type from pointer. The default of void* will work for most, but not all, legacy allocators. Legacy allocators that use non-raw pointer types, will need an explicit concept map for either Allocator or LegacyAllocator.

Also, insert a new header immediately following the concept map for Allocator<LegacyAllocator> and immediately before the description of Allocator members:

20.7.2.2.2 Allocator and Legacy Allocator members [allocator.concepts.members]

Modify the description of generic pointer as follows:

```
typename generic_pointer;
typename const generic pointer;
```

A type that can store value of a pointer (const_pointer) from any allocator in the same family as X and which will produce the same value when explicitly converted back to that pointer type. For any two allocators X, and Y of the same family, the implementation of a library facility using Allocator<X> and Allocator<Y>, is permitted to add additional requirements, SameType<Allocator<X>::generic_pointer, Allocator<Y>::generic_pointer> and SameType<Allocator<X>::const_generic_pointer, Allocator<Y>::const_generic_pointer> [Example:

<u>Default types</u>: X::generic pointer and X::const generic pointer if such types exists and void* and const void* otherwise.

And modify the definition of rebind as follows:

```
template<ObjectType T> class rebind type;
```

Class Template: The associated template rebind type is a template that produces allocators in the same family as X: if the name X is bound to SomeAllocator<value type, then rebind type <U> is the same type as SomeAllocator<U>. The resulting type SameAllocator<U> shall meet

the requirements of the Allocator concept. The default value for rebind is a template R for which R<U> is X::template rebind<U>::other.

```
template<ObjectType T> class rebind;
```

Class Template: The associated template rebind (for LegacyAllocator only) is a template containing a member type, other, that produces allocators in the same family as X: if the name X is bound to SomeAllocator<value_type>, then rebind<U>::other is the same type as SomeAllocator<U>. The resulting type SameAllocator<U>::other shall meet the requirements of the Allocator concept. The concept map for Allocator<LegacyAllocator> maps rebind type<U> to rebind<U>::other.

Rename rebind to rebind type

Modify paragraph 4 to rename rebind:

```
typename generic_pointer;
typename const generic pointer;
```

A type that can store value of a pointer (const_pointer) from any allocator in the same family (see member template rebind_type in 20.7.2.1) as X and which will produce the same value when explicitly converted back to that pointer type. For any two allocators X, and Y of the same family, the implementation of a library facility using Allocator<X> and Allocator<Y>, is permitted to add additional requirements, SameType<Allocator<X>::generic_pointer, Allocator<Y>::generic_pointer> and SameType<Allocator<X>::const_generic_pointer, Allocator<Y>::const_generic_pointer> [Example:

And the same thing for paragraph 7:

```
template<ObjectType T> class rebind type;
```

Class Template: The associated template rebind_type is a template that produces allocators in the same family as X: if the name X is bound to SomeAllocator<value_type>, then rebind_type<U> is the same type as SomeAllocator<U>. The resulting type SameAllocator<U> shall meet the requirements of the Allocator concept. The default value for rebind_type is a template R for which R<U> is X::template rebind<U>::other.

Note that the last use of rebind is deliberate and should not be changed to rebind type.

And also section 14.9.2.2 [concept.map.assoc], paragraph 3:

```
concept Allocator<typename Alloc> {
  template<class T> class rebind;
}
```

```
template<typename T>
class my_allocator {
  template<typename U> class rebind_type;
};

template<typename T>
concept_map Allocator<my_allocator<T>> {
  template<class U>
    using rebind_type = my_allocator<T>::rebind_type;
}
```

Replace construct element with construct

In section 20.7 [memory], in the synopsis for <memory>, remove construct_element:

```
//20.7.10, construct element
template < Allocator Alloc, class T, class... Args>
    requires AllocatableElement<Alloc, T, Args&&...>
    void construct element(Alloc& alloc, T& r, Args&&... args);
```

In section 20.7.3 [allocator.element.concepts] paragraph 8, modify the definition of the AllocatableElement concept and eliminate the related concept map:

```
auto_concept AllocatableElement<class Alloc, elassObjectType T, class...
Args>
{
    requires Allocator<Alloc>;
    requires FreeStoreAllocatable<T>;
    void Alloc::construct_element(Alloc& a, T* t, Args&&... args);

    void X::destroy(value type* p) {
        addressof(*p)->~value type();
    }
}
```

Remove section 20.7.10 entirely:

20.7.10 construct_element [construct.element]

```
template <Allocator Alloc, class T, class... Args>
    requires AllocatableElement<Alloc, T, Args&&...>
    void construct element(Alloc& a, T& r, Args&&... args);
```

[Note: The appropriate overload of the construct_element function is called from within containers to construct elements during insertion operations and to move elements during reallocation operations. It automates the process of determining whether the scoped allocator model is in use and transmitting the inner allocator for scoped allocators. —end note]

Effects: AllocatableElement<Alloc, T, Args&&...>::construct_element(a, addressof(r), forward<Args>(args)...)

Modify Section 23.1.1 [container.requirements.general], paragraph 3 as follows:

For the components defined in this clause that declare an allocator_type, objects stored in these components shall be constructed using construct_element (20.7.10) the construct member function, and destroyed using the destroy member function of the container's allocator (20.7.2.2) unless otherwise specified. (construct and destroy are specified in the AllocatableElement concept (20.7.3)). A container may directly call constructors and destructors for its stored objects, without calling the construct_element or destroy functions, if the allocator models the MinimalAllocator concept. [Note: If the component is instantiated with a scoped allocator of type A (i.e., an allocator that meets the requirements of the ScopedAllocator concept one of scoped_allocator adaptor or scoped_allocator_adaptor2), then construct_element may pass an inner allocator argument to T's constructor. — end note]

Rename construct_element to construct in section 23.2.7 [vector.bool], paragraph 2:

Unless described below, all operations have the same requirements and semantics as the primary vector template, except that operations dealing with the bool value type map to bit values in the container storage and AllocatableElement::construct_element(23.1)(20.7.3) is not used to construct these values.

Allocator Propagation

At the end of section 20.7.2.2 [allocator.concepts], add descriptions of the propagation functions:

```
X select on container copy construction (const X& x);
```

Returns: \times for allocators that should propagate from the existing container to the new container on copyconstruction, X() otherwise.

Default: returns x

Remarks: Used to select the allocator for a new container during copy-construction. The choice as to whether the allocator should propagate from the existing container to the new one varies by allocator type. See 23.1.1 [container.requirements.general].

[Note: in situations where the copy constructor for a container is elided, this function is not called. The behavior in these cases is as if $select_on_container_copy_construction$ returned x - end note]

```
X select on container move construction (X&& x)
```

Returns: move(x) for allocators that should propagate from the existing container to the new container on move-construction, X() otherwise.

Default behavior: returns move (x)

Remarks: Used to select the allocator for a new container during move-construction. The choice as to whether the allocator should propagate from the existing container to the new one varies by allocator type. See 23.1.1 [container.requirements.general].

[*Note:* in situations where the move constructor for a container is elided, this function is not called. The behavior in these cases is as if $select_on_container_move_construction$ returned x - end note]

```
void do on container copy assignment (X& to, const X& from);
```

Effects: assign to = from for allocators that should propagate from the right-hand container to the left-hand container on container copy-assignment; otherwise no effect.

Default behavior: does nothing

Remarks: The choice as to whether the allocator should propagate from the right-hand container to the left-hand container during assignment one varies by allocator type. See 23.1.1 [container.requirements.general].

```
void do on container move assignment(X& to, X&& from) { }
```

Effects: assign to = move (from) for allocators that should propagate from the right-hand container to the left-hand container move-assignment; otherwise no effect.

Default behavior: does nothing

Remarks: The choice as to whether the allocator should propagate from the right-hand container to the left-hand container during assignment one varies by allocator type. See 23.1.1 [container.requirements.general].

```
void do on container swap(X& a, X& b);
```

Effects: assign swap(to, from) for allocators that should propagate on container swap; otherwise no effect.

Default behavior: does nothing

Remarks: The choice as to whether the allocator should be swapped when containers are swapped varies by allocator type. See 23.1.1 [container.requirements.general].

In section 20.7 [memory], remove mention of the allocator_propagate traits from the <memory> synopsis:

```
// 20.7.4, allocation propagation traits
template <class Alloc> struct allocator_propagate_never;
template <class Alloc> struct allocator_propagate_on_copy_construction;
template <class Alloc> struct allocator_propagate_on_move_assignment;
template <class Alloc> struct allocator_propagate_on_copy_assignment;
template <class Alloc> struct allocator_propagation_map;
```

and

```
template <class Allocator OuterA, class Allocator InnerA>
struct allocator_propagate_never<scoped_allocator_adaptor<OuterA, InnerA>
>
: true type [ ];
```

Remove section 20.7.4 [allocator.propagation] in its entirety:

Remove section 20.7.5 [allocator.propagation.map] in its entirety:

20.7.5 Allocator propagation map [allocator.propagation.map]

```
template <class Alloc> struct allocator_propagation_map {
    static Alloc select_for_copy_construction(const Alloc&);
    static void move_assign(Alloc& to, Alloc& from);
    static void copy_assign(Alloc& to, Alloc& from);
    - static void swap(Alloc& a, Alloc& b);
}
```

Modify the end of Section 23.1.1 [container.requirements.general], paragraph 4:

Notes: the algorithms swap (), equal () and lexicographical_compare () are defined in Clause 25. Those entries marked "(Note A)" should have constant complexity. Those entries marked "(Note B)" have constant complexity unless allocator_propagate_never<X::allocator_type>::value is true

Allocator<allocator type>::select for move construction returns an allocator different from rv.get allocator(), in which case they have linear complexity.

Modify Section 23.1.1 [container.requirements.general], paragraph 8:

Unless otherwise specified, all containers defined in this clause obtain memory using an allocator (See 20.7.2). Copy and move constructors for all these container types defined in this Clause obtain an allocator by calling allocator propagation map::select for copy construction() Allocator <allocator type>::select on container copy construction or Allocator <allocator type>::select on container move construction on their respective first parameters. All other constructors for these container types take an Allocator argument (20.1.2), an allocator whose value type is the same as the container's value type. A copy of this argument is used for any memory allocation performed, by these constructors and by all member functions, during the lifetime of each container object or until the allocator is replaced. The allocator may be replaced only via assignment or swap (). Allocator replacement is performed by calling allocator propagation map<allocator - type>::move assign(), allocator propagation map<allocator type>::copy assign(), or allocator - propagation map<allocator ator type>::swap() Allocator<allocator type>::do on container copy assignment, Allocator <allocator type>::do on container move assignment, or Allocator <allocator type>::do on container swap within the implementation of the corresponding container operation. Calling the preceding Allocator functions may or may not modify the allocator, depending on the implementation of those functions for the specific allocator type. In all container types defined in this Clause, the member get allocator () returns a copy of the allocator object used to construct the container, or most recently used to replace the allocator.

Remove is scoped allocator trait

In section 20.7 [memory], remove is scoped allocator from the <memory> synopsis:

```
// 20.7.3, allocator-related traits
template <class Alloc> struct is_scoped_allocator;
```

and

Remove paragraphs 3 and 4 from section 20.7.3 [allocator.element.concepts]:

```
template <class Alloc> struct is scoped allocator : false type { };
```

[Note: If a specialization is_scoped_allocator<Alloc> is derived from true_type, it indicates that Alloc is a scoped allocator. A scoped allocator specifies the memory resource to be used by a container (as all allocators do) and also specifies an inner allocator resource to be used by every element of the container. —end note]

Requires: If a specialization is_scoped_allocator<Alloc> is derived from true_type, Alloc shall have a nested type inner_allocator_type and a member function inner_allocator() which is callable with no arguments and which returns an object of a type that is convertible to inner__ allocator_type.

Remove the last sentence of paragraph 2 from Section 23.1.4 [associative.reqmnts]:

Each associative container is parameterized on Key and an ordering relation Compare that induces a strict weak ordering (25.3) on elements of Key. In addition, map and multimap associate an arbitrary type T with the Key. The object of type Compare is called the comparison object of a container. This comparison object may be a pointer to function or an object of a type with an appropriate function call operator.—If the Compare type uses an allocator, then it conforms to the same rules as a container item; the container will construct the comparison object with the allocator appropriate to the allocator related traits of the Compare type and whether is scoped allocator is true for the container's allocator type.

Remove the last sentence of paragraph 3 in Section 23.1.5 [unord.req]:

Each unordered associative container is parameterized by Key, by a function object Hash that acts as a hash function for values of type Key, and by a binary predicate Pred that induces an equivalence relation on values of type Key. Additionally, unordered_map and unordered_multimap associate an arbitrary mapped type T with the Key.—If the Hash and/or the Pred type use an allocator, then they conform to the same rules as container items; the container will construct the Hash and Pred objects with the allocator appropriate to the the allocator related traits of the Hash and Pred types and whether is_scoped_allocator is true for the container's allocator type.

Modified scoped allocator adaptor

Modify the introduction of section 20.7.7 [allocator.adaptor] as follows:

20.7.7 Scoped Allocator Adaptor [allocator.adaptor]

The scoped allocator adaptor and scoped allocator adaptor2 class templates is an are allocator templates that specifies the memory resource (the *outer allocator*) to be used by a container (as any other allocator does) and also specifies an *inner allocator* resource to be used by every element in the container. This adaptor is instantiated with outer and inner allocator types. If The scoped allocator adaptor template is instantiated with only one allocator type (i.e., the second type is void), — the same allocator type is used for both the outer and inner allocator types and the same allocator instance is used for both the outer and inner allocator instances. The scoped allocator adaptor 2 template is instantiated with two allocator types, one for the inner allocator and one for the outer allocator. The interface is specialized for the single-allocator ease such that it takes only one allocator instance argument in the constructor, verses two allocators for the general case. Otherwise, the interface to the specialized and general cases are the same. A scoped allocator adaptor that is instantiated with two identical parameters is different than an adaptor instantiated with only one parameter; the former may be constructed with different instances of outer and inner allocators whereas the second may be constructed only with one allocator instance. [Note: the scoped allocator adaptor and scoped allocator adaptor 2 are is derived from the outer allocator type, so $\frac{11}{10}$ they can be substituted for the outer allocator type in most expressions. – end note. To minimize the chance that an allocator will be constructed in an inappropriate scope, these adaptors are not propagated on copy and move construction unless instantiated with allocators that are not defaultconstructible.

In section 20.7.7 [allocator.adaptor], completely replace the declarations scoped allocators with the following:

```
// Base class for exposition only
template<Allocator Alloc>
  class scoped allocator adaptor base : public Alloc
public:
  typedef Alloc outer allocator type;
  typedef Allocator<Alloc>::size type
                                        size type;
  typedef Allocator<Alloc>::difference type difference type;
  typedef Allocator<Alloc>::pointer
                                            pointer;
  typedef Allocator<Alloc>::const pointer const pointer;
  typedef Allocator<Alloc>::generic pointer generic pointer;
  typedef Allocator<Alloc>::const generic pointer
                                            const generic pointer;
  typedef Allocator<Alloc>::reference
                                           reference;
  typedef Allocator<Alloc>::const reference const reference;
  typedef Allocator<Alloc>::value type value type;
 pointer
               address (reference x)
                                           const;
 const pointer address(const reference x) const;
 pointer allocate(size type n);
 pointer allocate(size type n, const generic pointer u);
 void deallocate(pointer p, size type n);
  size type max size() const;
 void destroy(value type* p);
};
```

```
template<Allocator Alloc>
  class scoped allocator adaptor
    : public scoped allocator adaptor base<Alloc>
  typedef Alloc outer allocator type;
  typedef Alloc inner allocator type;
  requires DefaultConstructible<Alloc> scoped allocator adaptor();
  scoped allocator adaptor(scoped allocator adaptor&&);
  scoped allocator adaptor(const scoped allocator adaptor&);
  scoped allocator adaptor(Alloc&& outerAlloc);
  scoped allocator adaptor(const Alloc& outerAlloc);
  template <Allocator Alloc2>
   requires Convertible<Alloc2&&, Alloc>
    scoped allocator adaptor(scoped allocator adaptor<Alloc2>&&);
  template <Allocator Alloc2>
   requires Convertible < const Alloc2&, Alloc>
    scoped allocator adaptor(const scoped allocator adaptor<Alloc2>&);
  template <class T, class... Args>
   requires ConstructibleWithAllocator<T,inner allocator type,Args&&...>
    void construct(T* p, Args&&... args);
 // stop recursion
  template <class T, Allocator Alloc2, class... Args>
   requires ConstructibleWithAllocator<T, Alloc2, Args&&...>
    void construct(T* p, allocator arg t,
                   const Alloc2&, Args&&... args);
 const Alloc& outer allocator() const;
  const Alloc& inner allocator() const;
};
template<Allocator OuterA, Allocator InnerA>
  class scoped allocator adaptor2
    : public scoped allocator adaptor base<OuterA>
public:
  typedef OuterA outer allocator type;
 typedef InnerA inner allocator type;
  requires DefaultConstructible<OuterA> && DefaultConstructible<InnerA>
    scoped allocator adaptor2();
  scoped allocator adaptor2(scoped allocator adaptor2&& other);
  scoped allocator adaptor2 (const scoped allocator adaptor2 @ other);
  scoped allocator adaptor2 (OuterA&& outerAlloc,
                            InnerA&& innerAlloc);
  scoped allocator adaptor2 (const OuterA& outerAlloc,
                            const InnerA& innerAlloc);
```

```
template <Allocator OuterA2, Allocator InnerA2>
   requires Convertible<OuterA2&&, OuterA>
         && Convertible<InnerA2&&, InnerA>
    scoped allocator adaptor2(
                      scoped allocator adaptor2<OuterA2, InnerA2>&&);
  template <Allocator OuterA2, Allocator InnerA2>
   requires Convertible < const OuterA2&, OuterA>
         && Convertible<const InnerA2&, InnerA>
    scoped allocator adaptor2(
      const scoped allocator adaptor2<OuterA2, InnerA2>&);
  template <class T, class... Args>
   requires ConstructibleWithAllocator<T,inner allocator type,Args&&...>
      void construct(T* p, Args&&... args);
 // Recursion stop
  template <class T, Allocator Alloc2, class... Args>
   requires ConstructibleWithAllocator<T, Alloc2, Args&&...>
    void construct(T* p, allocator arg t,
                   const Alloc2&, Args&&... args);
  const OuterA& outer allocator() const;
  const InnerA& inner allocator() const;
private:
 inner allocator type inner alloc; // for exposition only
};
template <Allocator Alloc1, Allocator Alloc2>
 bool operator==(const scoped allocator adaptor<Alloc1>& a,
                  const scoped allocator adaptor<Alloc1>& b);
template <Allocator Alloc1, Allocator Alloc2>
 bool operator!=(const scoped allocator adaptor<Alloc1>& a,
                  const scoped allocator adaptor<Alloc1>& b);
template <Allocator OuterA1, Allocator InnerA1,
          Allocator OuterA2, Allocator InnerA2>
 bool operator == (const scoped allocator adaptor 2 < Outer A1, Inner A1 > & a,
                  const scoped allocator adaptor2<OuterA1,InnerA1>& b);
template <Allocator OuterA1, Allocator InnerA1,
          Allocator OuterA2, Allocator InnerA2>
 bool operator!=(const scoped allocator adaptor2<OuterA1,InnerA1>& a,
                  const scoped allocator adaptor2<OuterA1, InnerA1>& b);
template <Allocator A>
  concept map Allocator<scoped allocator adaptor<A> > {
    typedef scoped allocator adaptor<A> X; // for exposition only
    typedef X::value_type
    value_type;
    typedef X::pointer
                                    pointer;
```

```
typedef X::const_pointer const_pointer;
typedef X::generic_pointer generic_pointer;
    typedef X::const generic pointer const generic pointer;
    typedef X::difference_type
typedef X::size_type
typedef X::reference

difference_type;
size_type;
reference;
    typedef X::const reference const reference;
    template <class T> using rebind type =
      scoped allocator adaptor<Allocator<A>::rebind type<T> >;
    requires DefaultConstructible<X>
      X select_on_container_copy_construction(const X&) { return X(); }
    requires ! DefaultConstructible<X>
      X select on container copy construction(const X& x) { return x; }
    requires DefaultConstructible<X>
      X select on container move construction(X&&) { return X(); }
    requires ! DefaultConstructible<X>
      X\&\& select on container move construction(X\&\& x) { return move(x);}
}
template <Allocator A1, Allocator A2>
  concept map Allocator<scoped allocator adaptor2<A1, A2> > {
    typedef scoped allocator adaptor2<A1, A2> X; // for exposition only
    typedef X::value type
                                        value type;
    typedef X::pointer
                                       pointer;
    typedef X::pointer
typedef X::const_pointer
typedef X::generic_pointer
generic_pointer;
    typedef X::const generic pointer const generic pointer;
    typedef X::difference_type
typedef X::size_type

difference_type;
typedef X::size_type;
    typedef X::size_type
typedef X::reference
                                       reference;
    typedef X::const reference const reference;
    template <class T> using rebind type =
      scoped allocator adaptor2<Allocator<A1>::rebind type<T>, A2>;
    requires DefaultConstructible<X>
      X select on container copy construction(const X&) { return X(); }
    requires ! DefaultConstructible<X>
      X select on container copy construction(const X& x) { return x; }
    requires DefaultConstructible<X>
      X select on container move construction(X&&) { return X(); }
    requires ! DefaultConstructible<X>
      X\&\& select on container move construction(X\&\& x) { return move(x);}
}
```

Replace the function descriptions in sections 20.7.7.1 [allocator.adaptor.cntr], 20.7.7.2 [allocator.adaptor.members], and 20.7.7.3 [allocator.adaptor.globals] with the following:

```
20.7.7.1 scoped_allocator_adaptor_base members [allocator.adaptor.base]
               address(reference x)
const pointer address(const reference x) const;
   returns: this->outer allocator type::address(x);
pointer allocate(size type n);
   returns: this->outer allocator type::allocate(n);
template <typename HintP>
  pointer allocate (size type n, HintP u);
   returns: this->outer allocator type::allocate(n, u);
void deallocate(pointer p, size type n);
   effects: this->outer allocator type::deallocate(p, n);
size type max size() const;
   returns: this->outer allocator type::max size();
void destroy(pointer p);
   effects: this->outer allocator type::destroy(p);
20.7.7.2 scoped_allocator_adaptor constructors [allocator.adaptor.cntr]
requires DefaultConstructible<Alloc> scoped allocator adaptor();
   effects: Default-initializes the Alloc sub-object.
scoped allocator adaptor(scoped allocator adaptor&& other);
scoped allocator adaptor(const scoped allocator adaptor& other);
   effects: initializes the Alloc sub-object from other.outer allocator().
scoped allocator adaptor(OuterA&& outerAlloc);
scoped allocator adaptor(const OuterA& outerAlloc);
   effects: initializes the Alloc sub-object from outerAlloc.
template <Allocator Alloc2>
 requires Convertible<Alloc2&&, Alloc>
  scoped allocator adaptor(scoped allocator adaptor<Alloc2>&& x);
template <Allocator Alloc2>
 requires Convertible < const Alloc2&, Alloc>
  scoped allocator adaptor(const scoped allocator adaptor<Alloc2>& x);
   effects: initializes the Alloc sub-object from x.outer allocator().
```

```
20.7.7.3 scoped allocator adaptor2 constructors [allocator.adaptor2.cntr]
requires DefaultConstructible<OuterA> && DefaultConstructible<InnerA>
  scoped allocator adaptor2();
   effects: Default-initializes the OuterA sub-object and inner alloc member.
scoped allocator adaptor2(scoped allocator adaptor2&& other);
scoped allocator adaptor2(const scoped allocator adaptor2& other);
   effects: initializes the OuterA sub-object from other.outer allocator() and the
   inner alloc member from other.inner allocator().
scoped allocator adaptor2 (OuterA&& outerAlloc,
                             InnerA&& innerAlloc);
scoped allocator adaptor2(const OuterA& outerAlloc,
                             const InnerA& innerAlloc);
   effects: initializes the OuterA sub-object from outerAlloc and the inner alloc member from
   innerAlloc.
template <Allocator OuterA2, Allocator InnerA2>
requires Convertible<OuterA2&&, OuterA>
      && Convertible<InnerA2&&, InnerA>
  scoped allocator adaptor2(
                        scoped allocator adaptor2<OuterA2&,InnerA2>&& x);
template <Allocator OuterA2, Allocator InnerA2>
 requires Convertible < const OuterA2&, OuterA>
        && Convertible<const InnerA2&, InnerA>
  scoped allocator adaptor2(
                    const scoped allocator adaptor2<OuterA2&,InnerA2>&x);
   effects: initializes the OuterA sub-object from x.outer allocator() and the inner alloc
   member from x.inner allocator().
20.7.7.4 scoped_allocator_adaptor and scoped_allocator_adaptor2 members
[allocator.adaptor.members]
template <class T, class... Args>
 requires ConstructibleWithAllocator<T, inner allocator type, Args&&...>
  void construct(T* p, Args&&... args);
   Effects: outer allocator().construct(p, allocator_arg_t,
   inner allocator(), forward<Args>(args)...)
template <class T, Allocator Alloc2, class... Args>
 requires ConstructibleWithAllocator<T, Alloc2, Args&&...>
    void construct(T* p, allocator_arg_t,
                     const Alloc2& a2, Args&&... args);
   Effects: outer allocator().construct(p, allocator arg t, a2,
   forward<Args>(args)...);
   [Note: this overloaded version of construct is to prevent recursion into ever-deeper inner allocators in
   the case where the outer allocator is itself a scoped allocator adaptor. – end note
const outer allocator type& outer allocator() const;
```

```
returns: the outer allocator used to construct this object (i.e., the Alloc sub-object).
   const inner allocator type& inner allocator() const;
      returns: the inner allocator used to construct this object. For scoped allocator adaptor, returns
      the same reference as outer allocator(). For scoped_allocator_adaptor, returns the
      inner alloc member.
   20.7.7.5 scoped_allocator_adaptor globals [allocator.adaptor.globals]
   template <Allocator Alloc1, Allocator Alloc2>
     bool operator==(const scoped allocator adaptor<Alloc1>& a,
                       const scoped allocator adaptor<Alloc1>& b);
      returns: a.outer allocator() == b.outer allocator()
   template <Allocator Alloc1, Allocator Alloc2>
     bool operator!=(const scoped allocator adaptor<Alloc1>& a,
                       const scoped allocator adaptor<Alloc1>& b);
      returns: ! (a == b) .
   template <Allocator OuterA1, Allocator InnerA1,
              Allocator OuterA2, Allocator InnerA2>
     bool operator == (const scoped allocator adaptor 2<0uter A1, Inner A1>& a,
                       const scoped allocator adaptor2<OuterA1,InnerA1>& b);
      returns: a.outer allocator() == b.outer allocator() &&
      a.inner allocator() == b.inner allocator().
   template <Allocator OuterA1, Allocator InnerA1,
              Allocator OuterA2, Allocator InnerA2>
     bool operator!=(const scoped_allocator_adaptor2<OuterA1,InnerA1>& a,
                       const scoped allocator adaptor2<OuterA1,InnerA1>& b);
      returns: ! (a == b).
References
All documents referenced here can be found at
http://www.open-std.org/JTC1/SC22/WG21/docs/papers/2008/.
N2768: Allocator Concepts, part 1 (revision 2)
N2654: Allocator Concepts (Rev 1)
N2554: The scoped allocator model (Rev 2)
N2525: Allocator-specific move and swap
N2621: Core Concepts for the C++0x Standard Library
```

N2623: Concepts for the C++0x Standard Library: Containers